

A Study on Evaluation of Training Programme at HIPA, Shimla

Dr. Dolly Malla

Assistant Professor, GCCBA, Chandigarh, India

Abstract: Evaluation concerned with determination of change in staff behavior and fulfilled the desired change required in organization structure. This study was basically for the Evaluation of Internal Validation of Training Programme on Office Communication Skills: Noting and Drafting” held from 9.01.2023 to 11.01.2023 conducted at HIPA Shimla. The training programme was conducted for the Gazetted and Non-Gazetted officials of the State Government. The aim of evaluation was to find out that whether the training programme able to achieve their objectives in terms of cost incurred and benefits achieved. The data was collected through feedback form designed for the participants. The findings show that training courses is below the standard level and reaction, learning, behaviour and organizational levels need to be improved. The study showed that the training programme designed for the participants needed to be improved through implementation of optimizing training design, redefining training roles, attention to individual, job and organizational needs, motivation mechanism, and summative evaluation.

Keywords: Training, Evaluation, EOT, Kirkpatrick Model

Introduction:

As the word 'training' states to train. Training is provided at every stage. It is a mechanism for the purpose of modifying knowledge, skills and behavior and thus increasing competence for performance enhancement. Training is a learner centered approach for developing competency of employees for their efficient job performance and dynamic requirements of future

Whereas Evaluation of Training (EOT) is an important aspect of training to know that training inputs are efficient. It confirms whatever objectives were there that have been achieved or not. Evaluation is the systematic appraisal to determine worth, value or meaning of something to someone. Training evaluation is always neglected at all levels in the field of training. For any kind of evaluation requires collection of data or information for taking any decision. The training evaluation can be very fruitful and effective if properly planned and executed.

Mrunali T. and Pathak A. (2021), investigated the effectiveness of training and development on employee performance at JK Paper Ltd, Songadh. The research employed descriptive analysis. Primary data was collected through distributing questionnaires to 100 employees, who were selected through the random sampling technique. Findings reveal that overall training and development has a significant impact on employee's performance. It helps the organization in reducing employee turnover, increasing the productivity of employees, and contributing to higher financial returns for the organization. The study suggests that there is a need for improvisation in identifying the area where training needs have actually generated and salary structure should be revised at a regular interval of time. **Yimam M. H. (2022)**, assessed and investigated the impact of training on employees' performance in the technology focused academic institution. This study used a quantitative approach and the cross-sectional survey was used to collect data from a sample population of administrative employees of Bahir Dar University, Ethiopia who took training in 2019 chosen by simple random sampling. 316 questionnaires were distributed and collected for the study. Data were analyzed using both descriptive and inferential statistics. The results show that training design, training needs assessment, training delivery style and training evaluation have significant positive effect on employees' performance. Finally, the study recommended that human resource management should engage in increasing the qualities and quantities of the training program and properly apply the four phases of the systematic training processes to increase the performance of administrative employees of Bahir Dar University, especially the technology institutions.

Farjad S. (2012), Focused on Evaluation Effectiveness of training courses in Islamshahr University by Kirkpatrick Model. The study is an applied one and the data collection method has been descriptive. The statistical population consisted of personnels, Managers and teachers. The data was collected through the application of sampling, questionnaires. Descriptive statistics were used in order to measure the main indicators of effectiveness Evaluation of training courses. Research findings show that effectiveness of training courses is below the standard level and also data gathered about effectiveness evaluation indicated that reaction, learning, behaviour and organizational levels need to be improved. **Topno H. (2012)**, explained a systematic way of performing duties and assigned tasks. Moreover it bridges the gap between job requirement and employees present specification. The paper was descriptive in nature falls under the category of general review for understanding the conceptual framework of evaluation, its needs and purpose and the various models adopted by organization for evaluation purpose. Finally in conclusive remark paper suggests the most widely used model and what are the issues which lead to ignorance of evaluation as well as in the course of evaluation.

Urbancová et. al. (2021) aimed to find factors influencing evaluation of effectiveness of employee training and development. The data was obtained from a questionnaire survey in which 207 organisations operating in the Czech Republic participated. The results show that when evaluating the effectiveness of employee training, organisations prefer methods based on subjective evaluation by an evaluator (direct supervisors, colleagues), but also on their own self-evaluation regarding the number of training days. Due to the coronavirus pandemic, current human resources (HR) trends and priorities for 2021 have changed significantly. The systematic process of evaluating employee training effectiveness depends on the business sector (p-value 0.022), on the fact that the organization is or is not a part of a larger group (p-value 0.000).

Hipa Shimla:

The Himachal Pradesh Institute of Public Administration, popularly known as HIPA, was established on January 1, 1974 at Fairlawns a place about 12 kms from Shimla on the Mashobara road. The Institute is located in a building with a historical past. The building having serene and picturesque surroundings with well laid out spacious and luxuriant lawns was originally got constructed by Mr. R. Dixon of the foreign office of British India. Later, it was purchased by Nawab Muzaffar Ali Khan Quizzalbash of Malerkotla. On his migration to Pakistan in 1947 the property came to the Government of Punjab State, which converted it into a Circuit House. At the time of re-organization of States in November, 1966 the property was transferred to Himachal Pradesh government, which subsequently selected it for setting up the Institute.

The key stakeholders for the training functions at HIPA were as under:

- (a) HIPA
- (b) Course Director
- (c) Trainers
- (d) Trainees
- (e) Client Organisations

Research Methodology

Scope of Study:

The present study is undertaken to study the effectiveness of training programme conducted at different training institutes. The HIPA, Shimla has been selected for the study.

Objective of Study:

- To study the effectiveness of training programme conducted at HIPA, Shimla

Data Collection:

The present study is based mainly on primary data. The primary data has been collected through feedback format. Some secondary data has been collected through published records, reports etc.

Sample:

The study targeted the 18 respondents come for the Evaluation of Internal Validation of Training Programme on Office Communication Skills: Noting and Drafting training programme.

Evaluation of Training Programme with Different Steps:**Step-1****Areas of Improvement**

Performance is always considered most important and it is the heart of all training activities. There must be change in performance after the employees undergo any training. Hence, training should be efficient. The existing mechanism to evaluate any training programme is Course Director's Report, which is based upon feedback filled by the participants', expressing their views and ratings of trainers and training facilities. These are related to facilities available, quality and maintenance of the existing facilities, sessions conducted by the trainers, their delivery skills etc. Generally a questionnaire is given to judge the physical aspects of training. Same method has been applicable to this training programme as well. However, the real meaning of training evaluation is to judge the exact change in job performance and results achieved. The current system lacks this yardstick of judging the training activities.

Applying **Mark-Easterby-Smith Model** and keeping aims of this evaluation study in mind, Level 1 and Level 2 of evaluation levels are the appropriate levels for conducting evaluation process. L-1 and P-2 have been identified as Primary Cells for analysis applying the EoT Matrix. L-2, I-2 and M-2 will be the Secondary Cells accordingly.

EoT Matrix		Purpose			
		L	P	I	M
LEVEL	1	L-1	P-1	I-1	M-1
	2	L-2	P-2	I-2	M-2
	3	L-3	P-3	I-3	M-3
	4	L-4	P-4	I-4	M-4

L₁ & P₂ are the Key cells. On the basis of these cells, we can redesign the content of the course. The participants have given more theoretical knowledge. The practical sessions should be increased for the level of understanding. L₂, I₂, and M₂ are the

secondary cells. On the basis of these cells, we can test the Knowledge, Skills, Attitude of training during training and check the understanding of the participants.

a) Suggested Changes

The analysis of existing system point outs need for making changes in the current system practiced at HIPA, Shimla. Changes can be suggested using **A. C. Hamblin & D. L. Kirkpatric Models** at four different levels and purposes, as under:

1. Feedback form given at the end of the training needs modifications and it has to be revised to obtain specific information for evaluation of the training programme. It should be more comprehensive, practical and information oriented.
2. The design of the training programme should include sessions on computer related practical activities with inbuilt system of formative assessment
3. The group activities and exercises can increase their level of performance rather than long lectures.
4. The Course Director's Report also needs modification as presently feedback summary of the participants are considered as Course Report.

b) Deficiencies in the Existing System

Training programme must be cost effective and 'value for money' should be the basis of conducting training activities. There should be optimum return out of investment done on training. The expenditure includes expenses incurred by the training institute on the course and expenditure of the client organization due to absence of the trainee employees from the job and the amount of TA/DA paid to them.

If the participant's level of knowledge is low and not equal level with respect to knowledge and understanding, then it becomes very challenging job to maintain the same level. Much time is wasted out in making all of them to come at a similar level. To properly address this problem relating to Entry Behavior some steps have to be taken in advance, before training starts. This will save much of time, money and efforts and other resources as well.

To make the training programme efficient, some of the steps can be taken, which are discussed below:

1. To get maximum output number of participants should be restricted to a minimum level of 20 so that it will reduce the overhead costs. The cost will be equally distributed among the 20 participants. It will save money for the client organisation as well as the funding agency concerned. The use of infrastructure will also be optimised and on the full scale.

2. Distance Learning is a concept which can be utilised. The Distance Learning process will make the participants aware of the course and course contents. They will be at some level playing field of understanding with respect to subject matter before the course starts. They will have the basic information of subjects and topics going to be covered during course. It will save precious time, money and efforts.
3. For making the training programme effective, participants may be called in two phases. It will help a lot to assess the training properly as there will be a scope of checking changes that took place after training activities in terms of knowledge, skills or attitude of participants.
4. The content of the course should be reviewed to meet the aspirations of trainees as well as client organisations,
5. The design should include system of formative assessment within the course content.
6. There should be changes in IRQs to make the system of evaluation more effective.
7. Some checklists should be prepared for the subjects.
8. Course Director's Report needs modification currently summary of IRQ is taken as Course Report.

The existing system can be better analyzed with the help of SWOT analysis of the existing training system:

Swot Analysis

<p>Strengths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support of Government through National Training Policy. • Availability of Funds. • Specialised Training Institute for catering training needs • Existence of an evaluation system. 	<p>Opportunities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An opportunity to prove and confirm performance enhancement and transfer of learning. • An opportunity for client organisations to nominate their staff for efficiency and effectiveness.
<p>Weaknesses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The trainees are dealing with variety of subject matters. Hence, difficult to have common subjects in the curriculum. • Lack of awareness regarding training 	<p>Threats</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If not implemented effectively and efficiently funding of the institution by the client organisation will be affected. • The non-performance of trainees

<p>among participants as well as client organisations.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Absence of DLM and reading materials • It is very difficult to link the improved performance with training as results may be intangible. • Many of the visiting faculties have not undergone trainer development programmes, which may affect quality of training. 	<p>after training will put a question mark before HIPA.</p>
---	---

Step 2 -Functional Boundaries

The evaluation system pursued by the institute is being practiced since inception. It will be difficult and impractical to change the existing system within a short timeframe and it may create organizational, HR or financial problems. It has also been observed that the Training Organizations are least concerned about training activities as user or client organizations. Training is having least priority and it is solemnized as a ritual. Considering all these facts it will take time and effort to change the mind-set of client organizations as well as the training institute. Some functional boundaries observed in case of this course may be considered. The participants were working for different organizations performing diverse nature of jobs. Though number of participants were sufficient for classroom sessions but longer sessions with lecture method was sometimes ineffective. The topics decided, were of general in nature and sometimes participants felt it was not related to their existing job they were performing. The training activities were carried out on this background.

Role and responsibilities of Stakeholders:

Sl No.	Stakeholder	Role	Responsibility
1	Course Director	Conducting Training	Responsible for conducting effective and efficient training.
2	Training Institute (HIPA)	Designing & implementing training	Responsible for providing facilities and faculties and observing the training activity.
3	Training Designer	Designing Training	Responsible for preparation of module for learning.
4	Trainers (faculties for	Imparting training	Responsible for imparting

	the Course)		effective and efficient training.
5	Client Organisations	Achieving the desired goals.	Responsible for providing learning atmosphere, monitoring on job performance and providing inputs for module.
6	Trainees (Gazetted and Non –gazetted Officers)	Custodian of documents & processing cases	Responsible for effective and efficient job performance after training.

Step 3 - Existing System of Evaluation

The existing system of evaluation of training practiced at HIPA since inception is based upon a prescribed format of Department of Personnel and Training. All the trainee participants have to fill up feedback form at the end of the course in the last session called 'Valedictory Function.' Same procedure is adopted in every course. The format of evaluation has four parts:

Part-A:

This part of the format is devised to collect feedback of the trainee participants on the overall inputs of training. It comprises of following items:

- I. **Course Objectives:** The participants are asked to provide data regarding achievement of course objectives on a rating scale of 1 to 5 and a weightage average is calculated.
- II. **Course Design/ Structure and Utility:** same process is repeated for collection of data and weightage average.

Part-B:

- III. **Faculty Evaluation:** In this particular part of the evaluation of the trainer faculty is done by the participants. The participants are expected to evaluate the trainer in respect to the subjects covered. Application and relevance of the subject in the context of the participants, presentation of the subject matter, and suitability of the training method are the parameters for evaluating the trainer faculty on a four point scale.

After collecting the evaluation forms the weighted average is calculated, which is considered as overall rating of the course. The comments of the participants are also noted by the Course Director. He takes the following actions:

- Summarizes the comments of participants.
- Calculate the average rating given by the participants for each item.

- An explanation may be asked if the average rating is below 3 and asks to improve the situation next time.

PART-C:

- IV. Infrastructure/Support Facility:** facilities like Class-room, infrastructure, furniture, computers and equipment, administrative help etc.

PART-D:

- V. General Comments & Suggestion for Improvement:** like duration of course or any other suggestion for making improvement in the course.

Activities carried out in the system are as under:

<u>No.</u>	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Responsibility</u>
A.		
(a)	Obtain nomination from the client organisation	Course Director
(b)	Correspondence with client organisation for confirmation of Participation	
(C)	Preparation of Course Schedule	
(d)	Prepare Course Budget and seek approval of the Competent Authority.	
(e)	Correspondence with Resource Persons	
(f)	Preparation of Course Materials	
(g)	Correspondence for administrative arrangements	
B.	<i>Conduct the Course</i>	Course Director
C.		
(a)	Settling of Administrative matters	Course Director
(b)	Preparation of Course Report	
(c)	Sending Report to Training	
(d)	Sending Course File to Record Room	

In the case being discussed, Feedback Form (Questionnaire) was used for Internal Validation. From the Internal Validation and comments of trainee participants, Course Director prepared a report. The study has been the basis for evaluation of the course. Various points have been included in the Feedback Form (Questionnaire).

A bio-data form is used for collecting data from participants to understand their level of knowledge, job profile and other information. This exercise is carried out on the first day, at the beginning of the course, to check the Entry Behaviour of the participants attending the training programme.

The information and data obtained from the bio-data form and feedback, given at the end of the course are the basis for preparing the report of the Course Director. The

format for preparing the report has been standardized. This report is submitted to the higher authorities and called, Course Evaluation Report.

The comments and remarks about the training programme are also submitted with this evaluation report. This report is called the Course Director's report. The report discusses whether the programme needs any modification, improvement or change.

The existing system of training evaluation pursued at HIPA has been discussed in detail. The physical system at the institute and training faculty are being evaluated under this system. Neither Performance nor results achieved can be evaluated under this method which makes it mere evaluation of course by the Course Director not evaluation of the training programme Course Director's Report for the training programme.

STEP-4 AIMS

Key Aims

The Aim of the training evaluation of the course under question is as under:

- Revision of contents for including instruments of Formative Assessment.
- Change in feedback.
- Introduction of Check-lists.
- Preparation of Performance Aids.

Quantitative Measures

1. Number of participants expected to attend the training programme.
2. Number of participants actually attended the training programme.
3. Number of sessions planned.
4. Number of sessions conducted in actual.
5. Number of male and female trainee participants.
6. Number of sessions conducted by internal faculty of HIPA.
7. Number of sessions conducted by faculty from outside.

Qualitative Measures

1. The average rating given by the participants to the faculty.
2. Rating of internal faculty by the participant.
3. Finding out the most useful and least useful sessions based upon the views of the participants.
4. Overall rating of the course.

The aims and objectives of the training programme were explained to the participants, which is to give some inputs that will be useful for their job performance enhancement. This will be helpful in overall performance enhancement of the

organization and achieving better results. The knowledge, skill and attitude of the participants are be modified during the training sessions to achieve better results.

Step 5 -Key Tasks

The key tasks related to organizing the training programme on communication skills: noting and drafting can be explained as under:

To study the design and content of the course

Key task for the training programme are to provide inputs proper knowledge, skill and attitudinal developments to the trainee participants for enabling them to perform effectively and efficiently at their workplace.

In the course named communication skills: noting and drafting relevant inputs regarding domain knowledge and skill required to perform at workplace were provided to the participants. Sessions on Noting-drafting was included to cater their training needs.

Step 6 -Information Directly Affecting the Tasks

Once a training programme comes to an end, evaluation of the training programme becomes very difficult. However it is very important part of training activities and SAT Cycle is incomplete without evaluation of training and everything including money spent has to be assessed and justified to promote and further continue the training activities.

To evaluate Communication Skills: Noting and Drafting following steps were taken for obtaining valuable information much needed for carrying out assessment:

- **Collection of data** (Bio-data form of participants and feedback)
- **Record of conducted training** (Course Director's Report)

After exhaustive analysis of data collected and studying carefully, certain shortcomings or lacuna has been observed. In the light of tools and concepts, learnt during the EoT course the shortcomings can be analyzed as under:

1. **Entry Behaviour** of the participants was a major issue. All the participants were from different types of job assignments and very few things were common as far as their job profile is concerned.
2. Feedback was the only method to assess the training programme and this method cannot test transfer of learning. However, the feedback needs revision.
3. The training went more in lecture mode and very less session on practical mode. It had an adverse effect on participants behaviour and they felt like students rather than experienced and grown-up working force.

4. There was least concern about ***Formative Assessment** on the part of trainer.
5. There is a need to develop some ***Check-lists** and ***Performance Aids** to be used for ready reference at the workplace.
6. As there was no Group Work, Group Exercise, Assignments or Presentation, the participants took the programme very casually.
7. There was no provision to check on the job performance of the participants, it was taken very lightly by them.
8. The participants were not satisfied with some of the faculty, especially trainers for computers (IT) skills. They were demanding more practical sessions.
9. Trainees were not happy with the room provided in the hostel at the institute. Even they are dissatisfied with the services provided at hostel.

All these shortcomings should be addressed to make the training programme much more impactful and result oriented.

Step 7 -Tools of EoT Used for the study

a) EoT Tools

SWOT Analysis

Responsibility Mapping

Stakeholders Analysis

EoT Matrix

a) Mapping Responsibilities or listing the Roles of Different People

As per A. C. Hamblin and D. L. Krikpatric Model, evaluation of training should be conducted at four levels i. e. Reaction Level, Learning Level, Job Performance Level and Results Achieved Level. Job Performance Level and Results Achieved Level basically require external validation as well as calculating returns on investments (RoI) for the training. Evaluation of training at this level has to be done with certain time gap after conclusion of training. As it is not possible to conduct evaluation at all four levels owing to paucity of time, it will be appropriate to conduct evaluation at first two levels in consultation with the stakeholders.

The proposed changes in the EoT system require identifying actors and actions to be taken by them so as to enable the changes in evaluation system. The stakeholders responsible for carrying out changes include trainees, trainers, Course Director, client organizations and HIPA. Accordingly the Responsibility Mapping is done after

discussions with the people concerned to ensure their involvement, influence and relationship to the training process:

Responsibility Mapping

<u>Sr. No.</u>	<u>Actors</u> →	<u>HIPA</u>	<u>Course Director</u>	<u>Client Org</u>	<u>Trainers</u>	<u>Trainees</u>
	<u>Actions</u>					
1.	Revision of contents including instruments of Formative Assessment	S	R	S	S	I
2.	Change in IRQ	A	R	S	S	I
3.	Introduction of Check-lists	A	R	S	S	I
4.	Preparation of Performance Aids.	A	R	S	S	I

Key: R- Responsibility

A- Approval

S- Support

I- Inform

Step 8 - Detailed Development

Methods & Methodologies

For the purpose of evaluation of Communication Skills: Noting and Drafting at HIPA following methods/ methodologies were utilized for obtaining valuable information much needed for carrying out assessment:

IRQ

IRQ was provided to the participants for getting data for the facility provided to them and even feedback about the content, trainers and other facilities provided for post course assessment.

Collection of Data

Apart from above mentioned data and information, Bio-data form filled by the participants at the end of beginning of the course was also taken into account to study

the entry behavior of the trainee participants. Course Director's Report was also a source of relevant information for purpose of evaluation.

Step 9 -Implementation Details

Achieving Efficiency and Effectiveness in a training programme are the key factors which can be achieved if certain steps are followed to make sure that evaluation of training is done in a proper way. These steps can be incorporated in a system to make a procedure for EoT for future training programmes:

TNA

Proper TNA should be carried out taking into consideration the client organization's point of view and trainees inputs. This includes Job Chart, Job satisfaction and Responsibility Mapping, giving correct picture of the functioning of the organization as well as the employees. Some Questionnaire may be used for collecting performance related information from the expected trainee participants, officials etc.

Design of Training

The training design should be such that it should be helpful in performance enhancement of the trainees after undergoing the course. The actual training needs of the participants should be catered. The subjects or topics incorporated in the training curriculum should be in conformity with the design of training. The practical learning aspect of the participants should be taken care, as it has been reflected in the IRQs. Accordingly instruments of **Formative Assessment**, like exercises, games, quizzes have to be introduced in the design of the curriculum.

Distance Learning

The trainee participants should be sent some basic study materials and some exercises to have an understanding of the topics and subjects to be covered. This will help in bringing all the participants to a level playing field as far as Entry Behavior is concerned. In the age of Information Technology the Concept of Distance Learning should be popularized and used effectively, potential of Emails and other related facilities has not been exploited properly in the field of training in Government Organizations. It is not only time saving but makes the programme cost effective as well.

Revision of Feedback

Feedback, given at the end of the training also needs some modifications and it has to be revised to obtain specific information and evaluation of the training programme. To make it more comprehensive, practical and information oriented certain changes have been suggested.

Step 10 -Evaluation/Summary/Findings

1. To understand results of training EoT is necessary and without the SAT cycle is incomplete. Performance is at the heart of all training activities. Hence, performance enhancement is the goal of a training programme. EoT helps to judge the outcomes of the training and confirms the better results.
2. The training evaluation was carried out in the form of Course Director's Report. Participants of the course have expressed their views and ratings about the facilities available, ratings of the subject matter as well as the faculty involved in training. The evaluation was carried covering physical aspect of training.
3. The institute or the organisation has developed their own way of functioning and evaluating or assessing a training activity and which is in practice since long. It is always a difficult job to make a change in the existing system. Hence, it is always better to go for change in a slower pace, rather than going for immediate or sudden changes, which may create some organisational or HR problems. It should be taken into account that training is at a lower level in the priority list of client organisations.
4. Some functional boundaries have been discovered in this training programme. The participants are from same cadre but they are posted in different organisation with different job profiles with different experiences and their training needs are different as well. The class-room sessions and lecture methods adopted in the course lacks impact. Some of the topics were not relevant for the participants as they could not relate it with the job situations.
5. The entry behaviour of the participants was an issue to be addressed. Even they were not on a level playing field of knowledge and skills.
6. The only tool was used to evaluate the programme was the feedback form given at the end of the course, seems not adequate.
7. The training programme went in a teaching mode as lecture method was the only way for imparting training. The participants found themselves in student mode rather than in learning mode as adult human beings. Very less practical knowledge was imparted.
8. The attitude of the participants became casual as the training programme lacked group work, group exercises, assignments, presentations or other activities suited for adult learning.
9. The ideal number of participants should be 20 to justify the overheads and optimum use of the resources of the institute.

10. The concept of distance learning should be introduced to bring the participants on a same level playing platform and give them an idea about subject matter of the training programme.
11. To make the training programme efficient, training should be conducted into two phases. This will ensure checking the changes taken place at workplace after training in terms of knowledge, skill and attitude of the trainee participants.

References:

1. Farjad S. (2012), The Evaluation Effectiveness of Training Courses in University by Kirkpatrick Model (Case Study: Islamshahr University), *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* Volume 46, 2012, Pages 2837-2841
2. Mrunali T. and Pathak A. (2021), A study on the effectiveness of training and development on employee's performance at JK Paper Ltd." *International Journal of Creative Research Thoughts* | Volume 9, Issue 5 May 2021 | ISSN: 2320-2882
3. Topno H (2012), *Evaluation of Training and Development: An Analysis of Various Models*.
4. Urbancová et. al. (2021), *Effective Training Evaluation: The Role of Factors Influencing the Evaluation of Effectiveness of Employee Training and Development*, researchgate.
5. Yimam M. H. (2022), *Impact of training on employees performance: A case study of Bahir Dar university, Ethiopia*, Taylor and Francis online, Vol 9, Issue himachal.nic.in.